To: Governor-Elect Maura Healey and administration
From: The undersigned members of the Massachusetts Education Equity Partnership (MEEP)
Subject: Priority actions for advancing education equity in Massachusetts
Date: November 22, 2022

As organizations committed to educational equity and racial and economic justice, we write today with renewed hope for our state. We know that new leadership offers an opportunity to build on the state’s rich educational history and make improvements to our educational system so that it better serves students and families, especially from systemically underserved populations. That is why we urge you to do everything in your power to ensure that education equity is a top priority in your administration.

As your administration enters office, the Massachusetts education system stands at an unprecedented juncture. Following more than two years of learning and life disruptions caused by COVID-19, our state’s elementary/secondary student outcomes are lower than they have been in nearly 20 years. Already wide disparities in student learning experiences – disparities that have long undermined education for hundreds of thousands of students of color, students from low-income families, English learners, and students with disabilities – have grown even wider. Early education capacity – already in short supply – shrank, and has yet to rebound. Fewer students are enrolling in college, with the most significant drops among populations already under-represented on our college campuses. Across all education levels, students’ social-emotional and academic needs are at an all-time high.

At the same time, unlike many previous challenging moments, both our state and many districts facing the highest levels of need have substantial funding on hand to help support students, educators, and families. As a result, there is momentum on Beacon Hill to tackle long-standing fiscal challenges in early and higher education. As importantly, pandemic-era learning has left families and community partners even more prepared than they were before to help education leaders figure out how to support students.

Your leadership is paramount to seizing this critical and unique moment to leverage historic state and federal investments, and to advance policy and practice changes that serve and support improved outcomes and opportunities for systemically underserved students, families, and educators. Although we recognize that your administration will be confronting a multitude of challenges upon entering office, few are integral as education equity to the well-being of families across our state, to our state’s economy and democracy, and to the Commonwealth’s ability to live up to its values.

We submit this memo as the Massachusetts Education Equity Partnership (MEEP), a statewide collective effort of advocates for educational equity committed to building power and capacity in historically underserved communities, advancing policies and practices that achieve educational justice, and shifting decision-making power and representation throughout the education system to be inclusive of community voices. MEEP mobilizes a diverse group of leaders across sectors to strategically enhance opportunities for all Massachusetts families.
Recently, we released “There Is No Excellence Without Equity: A Path Forward for Education in Massachusetts,” a report that presents our vision for a more equitable early childhood through postsecondary education system that puts systemically underserved students and families first, ensures we have a well-prepared, well-supported, and diverse educator workforce and includes recommendations for how state leaders can seize this pivotal moment in our educational system to remedy persistent and growing disparities that underserved students and communities face in achieving equitable education opportunities. If our state reverts to the pre-pandemic status quo, these new, wider disparities could easily become a permanent, compounding feature of our education system, with devastating impacts not only on individual students and families but on our knowledge-based economy and our democracy.

This memo builds on our work and outlines priority recommendations and critical policy actions from our report that the Healey-Driscoll administration should take in its first days and first year to advance equity from early childhood through postsecondary education.

As you lead:

How policy and practice changes happen is nearly as crucial to their ultimate impact as the change itself. Through your leadership, you have the opportunity to set the tone for the state and ensure buy-in from stakeholders at every level, from the classroom to the boardroom. In the work ahead, we urge you to center student populations who have long been underserved in Massachusetts schools — Black and Latinx students, students from low-income families, English learners, and students with disabilities — their families, and the educators that support them. This means ensuring that agencies across your administration:

- **Commit to Disaggregated Data and Transparency:** Any state report, policy impact statement, press statement regarding new data, or other public documents should discuss and describe the implications of the research, data, or policy change not just for students on average, but for each demographic of the student population.

- **Model and demand authentic engagement:** Any policy or practice changes should be implemented in consultation with systemically underserved students, families, communities, and educators. We urge your administration to:
  
  - Partner with community-based organizations that work with systemically underserved families to facilitate focus groups, forums, site councils, and working groups.

  - Remove as many barriers to participation as possible by holding meetings both virtually and in person at different times of day, offering translation services, childcare, and transportation stipends. To acknowledge the time and expertise of stakeholders, compensate students, families, educators, and community members for their participation on task forces and in listening sessions.

- **Foster and support collaboration:** Establish cross-departmental collaborative structures to tackle issues such as expanding preschool access, establishing a birth-to-workforce longitudinal data system, reimagining postsecondary preparation and planning, and building strong and diverse early and K-12 educator pipelines. Collaborate, and foster local collaboration, with other human service agencies to ensure children and families get the support they need.
Table of contents

I. Increase access, affordability, and quality of early education

II. Ensure all elementary/secondary students get the learning experiences and support they need to thrive

III. Ensure that all students have an opportunity to access postsecondary education and can complete their learning without financial barriers

1 Increase access, affordability, and quality of early education and care

High-quality early childhood education is critical to children's future success — but in our state, children of color and children from low-income backgrounds do not have the same access to quality programs as their White and more privileged peers. Even before the pandemic, 62% of residents in low-income neighborhoods in Massachusetts lived in childcare deserts. Moreover, the high cost of child care puts early education out of reach for many families, even as educators in the sector — most women and many of them people of color — often make only minimum wage. The COVID-19 pandemic has only exacerbated these challenges.

In your first 100 days in office, we urge your administration to file, or if already filed, support, legislation that would:

- move Massachusetts closer to ensuring that families spend no more than the federally recommended 7% of their income on child care, prioritizing families with lower income levels;
- provide sufficient state resources to cover the actual cost of quality care to providers;
- guarantee early educators a pay scale comparable to that of elementary/secondary educators with similar credentials in their geographic area; and
- offer families living more than one mile from the nearest accessible childcare provider subsidies for transportation.

Following the first 100 days: MEEP partner, Strategies for Children is currently in the midst of a wide-ranging, inclusive effort to develop an Early Childhood Agenda for Massachusetts rooted in the experiences of families, early childhood professionals, and other critical partners. The results of this effort should be available in early 2023. At that point, we will follow up with additional recommendations for your first year in office based on this work and on MEEP’s There Is No Excellence without Equity report.

2 Ensure all elementary/secondary students get the learning experiences and support they need to thrive

Today, students and families continue to struggle with the social-emotional, health, economic and educational impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic. Schools across the state are reporting increased demand for mental health and social-emotional supports. A Spring 2022 Massachusetts Parent Survey showed that about half of parents are somewhat or very concerned about their child’s mental health. Among parents of students who were struggling academically, this number was closer to 75%.
Recent data show that student academic outcomes in Massachusetts are the lowest they’ve been in two decades. Less than half of our 4th graders are proficient in reading; just over a third of 8th graders are proficient in math – and that’s just on average. The Commonwealth’s education system has long been deeply unequal, and the latest data show that results for individual groups of students are even more dire. Less than 1 in 4 Black and Latinx 4th graders are proficient in reading and a half score below the Basic level. Just 16% of students from families with low incomes score proficient in math, compared to 49% of their higher-income counterparts. Across subjects and grades, proficiency rates for English learners and students with disabilities are often in the single digits.

These numbers are not a reflection of students’ ability to learn, nor of how hard educators across the state have been working to keep students safe and learning. However, they signal an educational crisis that demands an urgent, statewide, comprehensive response to address new and long-standing inequities in student learning experiences and outcomes. Therefore, we urge you to take the following immediate actions:

**First 100 days**

1. **Get serious about pandemic recovery**

   Despite the vastness and complexity of COVID-19’s impacts on student learning and well-being, Massachusetts’ approach to addressing the pandemic’s academic and social-emotional effects has mainly been scattershot at the state and district levels. The Department of Elementary and Secondary Education (DESE) has offered districts a range of guidance and financial and professional development resources. Still, in most cases, it is entirely up to districts to decide how and whether to use these supports. Multiple years into the crisis, state leaders have yet to ensure that every district has a plan for pandemic recovery, or that districts are using their pandemic recovery dollars effectively to address this unprecedented challenge. Instead, districts have been asked to submit applications and plans for different funding streams, contributing to siloing and incoherence that has long undermined educational improvement efforts, and making it nearly impossible for educators or families to understand what resources are available to students. Students struggling socially, emotionally, and behaviorally since returning to school from the pandemic are far too often met solely with calls for increased sanctions and hardened schools rather than with the empathy, understanding, and supports to address the harm they experienced during the pandemic.

   We urge you to work with leaders and staff at DESE to require and support all districts in putting in place three-year pandemic recovery plans that:

   - identify the most significant student learning and well-being challenges and how the district will work to address them, with particular attention to the following:
     - systemically underserved student populations, including Black and Latinx students, students from low-income families, English learners, and students with disabilities
     - high school students who have less time than most to tackle unfinished learning
     - elementary students struggling with reading and writing
     - students who have become disengaged from school
   - describe how the district will ensure that parents, families and communities are continuously engaged in pandemic recovery planning and ongoing tracking of effectiveness and outcomes;
2. Work to ensure all students and families get the wraparound supports they need – without paralyzing schools

Although schools cannot, and should not be expected to solve all of society’s challenges or meet all of the needs of students and families, in many communities, they are the main points of regular interaction with families. This means that schools are well-positioned to function as community hubs – connectors between families, community-based service providers, and other agencies. Today, it is more important for schools and districts to be able to serve this function than ever before, yet many still need the infrastructure, systems, or policies in place to do so.

We urge you to immediately establish a task force that includes representatives from DESE, human services agencies, school district leaders, community-based organizations, families, and students to identify key barriers to enabling districts to function as community hubs and develop recommendations for statewide action to address these challenges. We then urge your administration to implement the task force’s recommendations within your first year in office. Such recommendations might include the following:

- make clear the academic and social-emotional supports available to students, and how the district will ensure that these supports reach the students who most need them. Specify how the district (with state support where relevant) will address barriers to access, such as transportation needs;
- specify how, and how quickly the district will use unspent federal pandemic recovery funds and Student Opportunity Act dollars to support these efforts;
- integrate resources and supports available from DESE, such as program-specific grants, professional development opportunities, and technical assistance; and
- outline clear 3-year and annual improvement goals, by student group, for improvement in student learning and equity therein that the district expects to see.

3. Make critical strides in increasing educator diversity

We appreciate and support your campaign’s emphasis on increasing diversity in the educator workforce. As you have pointed out, educator diversity is critical to creating the kinds of schools and learning environments students need to thrive. To move this priority forward, we urge you to:

- file or, if already filed, lend your support to the Educator Diversity Act;
- through the state budget, increase the individual awards for the Paraprofessional Teacher Preparation Grant, which have not changed since 2003;
- incentivize more homegrown educators to enter the teaching profession. Through the 2024 State Budget process, set up a scholarship program for Gateway Cities or Boston high school graduates who go on to teach in Gateway Cities or Boston schools; and
To build on the progress of the first 100 days and lay groundwork for future improvement, we urge you to take the following steps in your first year:

**First Year**

1. **Elevate the voices of students, families, and educators – and make them count**

Research has repeatedly shown that having a sense of belonging in their school community is critical to students' academic success and social-emotional well-being. Educators, too, are more likely to remain in a given school and even within the profession if they feel respected, supported, and connected to their colleagues. Harmful and discriminatory work environments are a crucial reason why educators of color leave the profession more frequently than their White colleagues.

Shaping positive, supportive, and inclusive learning environments and working conditions must begin by listening to students, families, and educators. High-quality surveys can be powerful tools for obtaining such input (See Illinois' 5Essentials survey, for example, or Rhode Island's SurveyWorks). Most districts, however, lack the internal capacity to develop valid and reliable survey instruments. Moreover, using different surveys in every district undermines community collaboration and learning. Therefore, we urge your administration to work with DESE to develop and implement statewide student, family, and educator surveys and require their use in school/district improvement efforts. More specifically:

- **Survey Development**: Survey instruments should be developed with input from students, families, educators, community stakeholders, and researchers. At the student level, the VOCAL survey should be expanded to all grades that take the MCAS and made mandatory, rather than optional.
- **Public reporting**: Survey results and participation rates should be publicly reported at the state, district, and school level, disaggregated by student population (for students and families), and by, at minimum, race/ethnicity for educators. Results should not be reported for populations of less than 10 respondents to protect privacy.
- **Use of results**: Schools and districts where survey results suggest school climate or working conditions challenges should be required to work with students, families and educators to address those challenges in their school improvement plans. DESE should provide coaching and technical assistance for districts and schools on result interpretation and improvement planning.

“I think that if kids don’t feel like they belong, they’re not going to learn. So first and foremost, they need to feel like they belong there. There’s a place for them there that they’re valued, that they’re valued for who they are. They can be their authentic selves.”

-Parent, MassINC focus group, Fall 2022
2. Ensure that curriculum in all districts -- especially those underperforming for one or more student groups -- is standards-aligned, culturally sustaining, and evidence-based

All students can soar academically when they receive high-quality instruction and support that builds on their strengths, challenges them, and connects meaningfully with their interests and experiences. But today, for too many students — especially students of color, students who are low-income, English learners, and students with disabilities — such instruction is the exception, rather than the rule. One key driver of these patterns is the quality of curricular materials. Too many districts are using outdated textbooks and other materials that center the accomplishments and experiences of White men above all others. Others rely on reading programs widely shown not to comport with research on how students learn to read. Moreover, when districts shift to new curricula, teachers often do not receive the support they need to implement the changes.

In his October 18th memo to the Board of Elementary and Secondary Education, Commissioner Riley outlined plans to support districts in improving the quality of instructional materials with grants, technical assistance networks, and professional learning opportunities for educators. We urge your administration to support these efforts and strengthen them by working with DESE to:

- modify the CURATE curriculum evaluation rubric to more explicitly focus on cultural responsiveness and inclusivity for students with disabilities and English learners;
- require any district deemed underperforming for one or more student populations under the state accountability system to use curricula rated highly on CURATE;
- require all districts to demonstrate that they are using evidence-based literacy curricula and instructional methods aligned with the Science of Reading and rated highly on CURATE or EdReports, research-based approaches to early literacy instruction; and
- provide grants to support job-embedded professional development and coaching for teachers to implement any curricular changes (see Tennessee’s Reading 360 initiative as an example).

“Staying engaged in my classroom tends to get really hard for me because I don’t see myself represented in the classroom or in textbooks

- Jada, high school student

3. Empower families with better data

Recent parent focus groups conducted by the MassINC Polling Group revealed enormous variation in the quality, depth, and frequency of information families receive about their child’s learning. Parents also differed substantially in how they gauged whether their child is academically on grade level. Some relied on grades and teacher reports, for example, while others reflected on what they themselves had learned in school in a given grade. Others, still, thought about how their child performed compared to peers.
Information is power. Today, when standards-based measures consistently show that many students are struggling academically, clear communication between schools and families about student learning and wellbeing is critical. Families who are not aware of their child’s learning challenges may not take advantage of resources such as tutoring or afterschool programs, or may not know that they need to practice certain skills with their child at home. Considering the fact that research shows a pattern of lower expectations in schools serving the most students from low-income families and students of color, families in these communities may be significantly shortchanged when it comes to accurate information about their children’s learning.

We urge you to work with DESE to:

- in consultation with families and educators, develop guidelines for the frequency, modes, and types of communications that should be expected of every school in every district;
- revamp state-issued MCAS reporting. MCAS results are meant to supplement the information families receive about their child’s learning from their schools and teachers. Current MCAS reports, however, fail to include critical information, such as whether a child is on track to stay on grade level or to reach grade level if behind, which broad skills categories (e.g., long division) a child has mastered and where they are struggling, and what parents can do to help their child. DESE should work with organizations experienced in sharing data with families (e.g., Ed Navigator or Learning Heroes) to improve the usefulness of the MCAS reports, including by linking to vetted, high-quality resources families can use to help students catch up; and
- require districts to ensure that interim assessment results shared with families throughout the year contain similar information (at minimum) to revised state MCAS reports.

Ensure that all students have an opportunity to access postsecondary education and can complete their learning without financial barriers

In Massachusetts’ knowledge-based economy, postsecondary education has never been more critical to achieving social and economic mobility not just for individual students, but for entire families and generations. Before the pandemic, systemically underserved students in the Commonwealth experienced vast disparities in access, affordability, and completion of postsecondary education. The pandemic, which disproportionately impacted systemically underserved student populations and their families, has resulted in more high school graduates unsure about their postsecondary plans, declining enrollment across our state’s public institutions of higher education (IHEs) – especially among systemically underserved students, and rising costs of college – which have left many students priced out of a college education. To reverse these trends, MEEP recommends the following priority areas to both immediately address equity concerns and establish a foundation for long-term, systemic change:

“My daughter, she’s going to be a senior and she doesn’t know what the future’s going to look like for her and what she should do in the future. So she has some uncertainty and she feels stressed because she’s going to apply for college and she’s worried that she cannot go to the colleges she really wants to go to.”

-Lucy, Massachusetts parent
Today, in too many districts, college and career planning occurs in a piecemeal, haphazard way that relies too much on students and families to figure things out outside the school day, and on overburdened counselors who do their best to support students but cannot possibly tackle this work alone. As a result, too many young people and their families – especially students who would be the first in their families to go to college – are left to make life-changing decisions, such as whether or where to apply/enroll, how much debt to take on, and even what to study – with minimal information. While progress has been made to bridge the divide between secondary and postsecondary education, the initiatives have not yet been scaled.

To systematically support students’ postsecondary aspirations, we urge the next administration to launch a task force to reimagine postsecondary exploration and planning across the state. The task force should bring together K-12 and higher education leaders, the business community, guidance counselors, families, students, community organizations, and educators to develop recommendations for a comprehensive, statewide approach to postsecondary exploration and planning, including a series of graded postsecondary planning courses required for all middle and high school students. The task force should be charged with:

- aligning existing resources and frameworks, such as DESE’s My Career and Academic Plan (MyCAP) tool and the career readiness work undergone by the Commonwealth between 2016 and 2019;
- developing a series of graded college and career planning courses required for all students beginning in middle school. The approach should include a set of research-backed college and career planning milestones that students must complete (i.e., career exploration, information on college or postsecondary training options, including information on earning and debt potential for various pathways), FAFSA completion, college applications, and clear guidance about the course of study and other experiences students will need in middle and high school to pursue their postsecondary goals; and
- publishing a playbook that includes an implementation plan to help schools and districts create a multi-year postsecondary planning approach aligned (though not necessarily identical to) the task force’s model, including, for example, funding streams that schools and districts can leverage to implement the postsecondary planning courses, a timeline for the hiring of additional counselors, incentives that can be leveraged to hire additional counselors, especially counselors of color, and training aligned to this new model for pre-and in-service guidance counselors.

We then urge you to implement the task force's recommendations as quickly as possible, with significant progress made by the first year of your administration.
2. Increase college affordability, especially for students from low-income families

Within the first 100 days, the Healey-Driscoll administration will be tasked with drafting a proposal for the state budget for the fiscal year 2024. Most state funding allocated to public higher education goes directly to the different institutions to support their general operating budgets, but the state budget also supports need-based scholarship programs for students with the highest financial need, who are disproportionately students of color. However, investment in the scholarship fund has yet to keep up with college attendance costs. Consider this: In 1980, MassGrant covered about 80% of recipients’ tuition and fees; in 2020, it covered just 10%. In the 2019-20 school year, students’ financial aid, family contributions, and work earnings failed to cover the cost of attendance at 20 of 27 Massachusetts public IHEs included in NCAN’s study, leaving tens of thousands of students to take on burdensome levels of student loan debt.

To make public colleges more affordable for the Commonwealth’s students, we urge the next administration to increase investment in MassGrant and MassGrant Plus through the State Scholarship Program (line item 7070-0065) in the gubernatorial fiscal year 2024 state budget proposal. This investment will help to offset some of the direct costs of attending college, making it easier for more students to pursue higher education while the state pursues comprehensive higher education funding reform. In addition, we urge you to continue and increase funding and support for Early College programs that not only enable students to earn college credit at no cost while in high school, but help set students up for success in postsecondary education.

3. Ensure college is affordable for undocumented students

Massachusetts is home to 153,364 undocumented immigrants – only about 8% of whom are Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA)-eligible residents. Yet, Massachusetts policy offers in-state tuition and state financial aid only to DACA and Temporary Protected Status (TPS) recipients, leaving more than 90% of our state’s undocumented population without affordable access to higher education even though many have spent most of their lives here. These students often have no option but to take out private student loans to pay for college and the associated costs of attendance. Furthermore, Massachusetts does not have legislation that affirmatively extends occupational and professional licensure to undocumented individuals meaning that many students enroll in IHEs without the possibility of participating in our state’s economy.

We urge you to file or, if already filed, support legislation allowing undocumented students access to in-state tuition and fee rates, state financial aid, and professional and occupational licensure. These policies would be life-changing for many students in the Commonwealth and would also serve to mitigate declining enrollment and labor shortages in high-demand industries.

First Year

To build on the progress of the first 100 days and lay groundwork for future improvement, we urge you to take the following steps in your first year:
1. Uplift and ensure implementation of the state’s higher education Equity Agenda

Massachusetts is consistently lauded as the most educated state in the nation; it is home to the highest percentage of bachelor’s, graduate, and professional degree-holders. But our high overall rankings mask deep inequities in student experiences and outcomes. Even before the pandemic, only 28% of Black residents and 20.8% of Latinx residents held a Bachelor’s degree or higher, compared to 48.2% of their White counterparts. These disparities are pervasive across critical indicators like enrollment, retention, and completion and our English learners and students with disabilities often face additional challenges.

To reverse these trends, Massachusetts has taken the critical step of identifying equity as a statewide goal. In 2018, the Board of Higher Education (BHE) set forth the Equity Agenda, which outlines how the BHE and DHE, in partnership with the Massachusetts public institutions of higher education, plan to produce equitable outcomes while increasing enrollment, and attainment of systemically underserved students. In subsequent years, DHE has taken thoughtful steps to advance the agenda by launching a three-year policy and program audit to ensure racial equity across public IHEs in Massachusetts, and developing a Strategic Plan for Racial Equity, a report that outlines their vision for achieving racial equity. We urge your Administration to support these efforts and strengthen them by:

- publicly committing to the vision outlined in the Equity Agenda;
- working with DHE and BHE to set ambitious goals aligned to the Strategic Plan for Racial Equity, ensuring that all goals are disaggregated by student race/ethnicity and demand more progress for underserved student populations; and
- requiring DHE to track and publicly report annual progress on the efforts made to advance state-set goals in the Equity Agenda, their impact, and the overall progress made towards the goals outlined in the Agenda.

2. Equitably and adequately finance public higher education

Over the last 15 years, Massachusetts public IHEs have served about 70% of Massachusetts students attending college. In those 15 years, enrollments have significantly declined, the student population has become increasingly diverse, and the number of part-time students has increased. Despite these changes, state funding allocations have remained static. Today, Massachusetts contributes roughly $1.9 billion annually to financing public higher education. However, these funds are not allocated with any regard for the number of students served or the support and resources that students need. Furthermore, Massachusetts lags behind other states in public higher education spending as a share of total budgetary expenditures, higher education spending per capita, and per-student state support.

The Board of Higher Education has embarked on a strategic review of public higher education financing. The review will culminate with recommendations for alternative approaches to financing public higher education in Massachusetts. As the next administration considers these financing models, we urge you to publicly support and endorse a system that:

- distributes larger shares of appropriated dollars to institutions that have the highest unmet need, including colleges and universities that serve a high percentage of systemically underserved students;
- is transparent and rooted in data;
- allows institutions to plan long-term for programs and initiatives that best serve students’ needs; and
- results in increased affordability for students from low-income families.
3. Empower students with the information they need

Each year, prospective students looking to head to college face an important decision about where to pursue higher education. Some factors that students consider when looking at potential colleges are affordability indicators, graduation rates, and career outcomes. These data are especially critical for systemically underserved students who are interested in how likely students like them are to succeed at different institutions. However, the current data reporting leaves students with incomplete details necessary to make informed decisions about their postsecondary education plans.

To ensure that students are empowered with the information they need, we urge you to work with leaders and staff at DHE to redesign the Performance Measurement Reporting System (PMRS) so that it:

- allows students and families to explore and compare key indicators like enrollment, tuition, and completion across institutions and is regularly updated to provide families the most current information available;
- includes additional critical equity indicators such as, for example, more affordability data, including student debt held by graduates and the median earnings of graduates of each institution, faculty diversity data, and information on enrollment in degree-granting programs so that students can make informed decisions about their education;
- includes additional subgroups, like students with disabilities to allow monitoring of the implementation of the new law, passed during the last legislative session, “Creating Higher Education Opportunities for Students with Intellectual Disabilities, Autism, and other Developmental Disabilities;” and
- includes data for additional institutions, including all University of Massachusetts (UMASS) campuses.

Respectfully submitted,